



151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East

Heritage Assessment

Statement of Evidence

Draft Report



Acknowledgement of Country

We respect and acknowledge the Wurundjeri Woi Wurrung Cultural Heritage Aboriginal Corporation, their lands and waterways, their rich cultural heritage and their deep connection to Country, and we acknowledge their Elders past and present. We are committed to truth-telling and to engaging with Wurundjeri Woi Wurrung Cultural Heritage Aboriginal Corporation to support the protection of their culture and heritage. We strongly advocate social and cultural justice and support the Uluru Statement from the Heart.

Report register

The following report register documents the development of this report, in accordance with GML's Quality Management System.

Project	Issue No.	Notes/Description	Issue Date
3013	1	Draft Report	1 April 2022

Quality assurance

The report has been reviewed and approved for issue in accordance with the GML quality assurance policy and procedures.

Copyright

© GML Heritage Pty Ltd 2022

This report has been produced for the client as an internal document. Except as allowed under the *Copyright Act 1968* (Cth), no part may be copied, transmitted, published, or otherwise dealt with in any form without permission in writing from GML Heritage and the owners of copyright in images or other matter in that part of the document.

Pre-existing copyright in images and other matter is acknowledged where appropriate. Although a reasonable effort has been made to obtain permission to reproduce copyright material, GML Heritage does not warrant that permission has been obtained in all cases.

Source of images is GML unless otherwise stated.

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Purpose	1
1.2	Instructions	1
1.3	Sources of information	1
1.4	Qualifications, experience and area of expertise	2
1.5	Summary of opinion	2
1.6	Further changes recommended in response to submissions	3
1.7	Declaration	3
2	Response to submission	4
2.1	Introduction	4
2.2	151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East (Submission 21)	5
2.2.1	Recommendations and amendment to 208more	7
2.2.2	Statement of Significance	7
2.2.3	Heritage matters for discussion	8
2.2.4	Conclusion and recommendations	13
3	References	14

1 Introduction

1.1 Purpose

- [1] I, Kim Roberts, have prepared this statement of evidence for City of Moreland in relation to Amendment C208more to the Moreland Planning Scheme Amendment (the Amendment).
- [2] The Amendment proposes to implement the recommendations of the 'Moreland Heritage Gap Study' (the Assessment), prepared and revised by Context in 2017.

1.2 Instructions

- [3] This statement of evidence has been prepared in response to the instructions of the City of Moreland (Council) within the context of Amendment C208more (the Amendment) to the Moreland Planning Scheme. It addresses that part of the Amendment that seeks to include properties assessed in the Study as being of heritage significance in the Heritage Overlay (HO).
- [4] It has been requested that I review a submission regarding 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East and provide an opinion on the heritage significance of this individual property recommended for the inclusion in the HO.
- [5] I understand that the methodology for the study has been detailed in prior planning panel sessions for this amendment. Therefore, while I have reviewed the methodology report for the 'Moreland Heritage Gap Study, Stage 2' (2019) in the course of preparing this statement, I have not detailed that methodology as part as this statement but rather have referred to it as necessary.

1.3 Sources of information

- [6] This statement draws upon the following documentation:
 - Context 2019, 'Moreland Heritage Gap Study, Stage 2'
 - Planning Practice Note 1 'Applying Heritage Overlay' (PPN01), 2018
 - Historia 2010, 'City of Moreland Thematic History'
 - Moles, Jennifer A 2007, 'Review of Heritage Provisions in Planning Schemes. Advisory Committee Report'

- [7] A public realm site inspection to 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick and several comparative properties was carried out on 27 March 2022.

1.4 Qualifications, experience and area of expertise

- [8] I am an architect and heritage consultant and have been engaged in the heritage field for over 18 years. I have been actively providing heritage and heritage asset management advice to private individuals and businesses, municipal councils, and the Victorian Director of Housing and Secretary of Human Services regarding sites listed at Local, State and National level during this time. Since 2016 I have been a member of the Victorian Design Review Panel where I engage in peer review of architectural projects, particularly those within heritage contexts. I have also been recently appointed to the newly created Ballarat Design Review Panel. I have extensive experience working with the Planning Scheme, and a solid understanding of the Planning Scheme Amendment process. I have acted on behalf of the Director of Housing and as an expert witness for Greater Bendigo City Council at Planning Panels in the past.
- [9] The area of expertise I have that is relevant to this Planning Panel hearing is the assessment of cultural heritage significance of places, buildings and structures within the wider Victorian context.
- [10] My curriculum vitae outlining my heritage qualifications and experience with respect to heritage issues is attached as Appendix A to this report.

1.5 Summary of opinion

- [11] The Amendment adds significant heritage properties to the HO and should be supported. The inclusion of 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East is justified by the citations prepared as part of the 'Moreland Heritage Gap Study' (2019).
- [12] The place citation for this property determines that it meets the 'threshold' of local significance based on HERCON Criteria. Further, it responds to the broad historical themes articulated in City of Moreland Thematic History (2010) and provides a comparative analysis against properties currently subject to the HO.

1.6 Further changes recommended in response to submissions

[13] I recommend that minor revisions are made to the place citation of 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East. This should include reference to textured tapestry bricks as well as clinker bricks in the place description and Statement of Significance. Reference to the blue tiled stallboard should also be altered to refer to blue glazed brickwork to the lower façade as part of these changes.

[14] A revised citation for 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, is included as Appendix B of this evidence.

1.7 Declaration

[15] I have made all the inquiries that I believe are desirable and appropriate and no matters of significance which I regard as relevant have to my knowledge been withheld from the Panel.

Signed,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kim Roberts'.

Dr Kim Roberts

2 Response to submission

2.1 Introduction

[16] This section of the report contains information regarding 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, a place where an owner or their representative has made a formal submission to Council. The heritage-related objections are summarised, and my response is provided.

[17] In my evidence I will respond only to issues related to the heritage significance of the place, such as its inherent physical characteristics, building typology, intactness (and condition where this impacts upon intactness), history, and comparison to other places. I will generally not respond to issues that are not associated with confirming the heritage significance of the places and which would be better assessed as part of a planning permit application should they be added to the Heritage Overlay. Such issues include maintenance costs, property value, and future development plans.

2.2 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East (Submission 21)



Figure 1. 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East. (Source: GML Heritage Victoria t/as Context 2017)



Figure 2. Detail of parapet, showing distinctive stepped profile and geometric patterning. (Source: GML Heritage Victoria t/as Context 2017)



Figure 3. 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East. (Source: GML 2022)



Figure 4. Shopfront, 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East. (Source: GML 2022)

2.2.1 Recommendations and amendment to 208more

[18] This place was assessed as part of the Moreland Heritage Gap Study and found to be of local significance. It is recommended for inclusion in the Moreland Heritage Overlay as an individual place. The reasons for its significance are set out in the following Statement of Significance.

2.2.2 Statement of Significance

What is significant?

[19] The shop at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, which was constructed by 1935, is significant. This is a single-storey shop with a finely detailed stepped parapet featuring geometric patterning in clinker brick and render. It retains an original shopfront with metal-framed windows, glazed blue bricks to the lower façade and a recessed entry with a tiled floor and glazed timber door. The cantilevered verandah may be original but has been boxed in.

[20] Non-original alterations and additions are not significant.

How is it significant?

- [21] The shop at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, is of local architectural and aesthetic significance to the City of Moreland.

Why is it significant?

- [22] It is significant as a representative example of an interwar shop that is notable for its high degree of intactness. The parapet, with its distinctive stepped profile and geometric patterning that demonstrates the influence of the Jazz Moderne or Art Deco style, retains the original finishes and is a notable feature. It is complemented by the original shopfront. (Criteria D & E)

2.2.3 Heritage matters for discussion

- [23] The submitter objects to the proposed inclusion of 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, as an individually significant place in the Heritage Overlay. This section of the report responds to the objection raised in Submission 21, focusing on matters pertaining to heritage significance only. The key points raised by the submitter are provided in italics beneath a series of subheadings below. My response follows each excerpt.

Significance

- [24] *The submitter does not agree that the place meets the relevant thresholds for heritage significance as an individually significant place.*
- [25] In considering the relative significance of 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East I reviewed the place citation and methodology of the Moreland Heritage Gap Study to confirm that the thresholds for individual significance were met. I visited the site on 27 March 2022 to confirm the currency and veracity of the place description and integrity statement. As an extension of this site visit, key comparative examples noted in the place citation were also visited to verify the comparative analysis.
- [26] Places that are considered to meet the threshold for individual local heritage significance satisfy one or more of the model heritage criteria set out in PPN01 and are associated with historical themes set out in the local Thematic Environmental History.
- [27] The place citation for 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, clearly associates the property with City of Moreland Thematic History (2010) Theme Nine: Shopping and Retailing in Moreland. The contextual history of the place citation identifies Lygon Street as 'a shopping and manufacturing precinct' that was important for accessing

goods and services and supported the social life of the neighbourhood. By the 1930s, when the subject shop at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, was constructed, Lygon Street was, as the contextual history states: 'a hive of manufacturing activity'. This increased activity led to a new historical layer of residential development and drove the requirement for new 'retail premises to serve the rapidly growing population'. Appropriately, given this historical development context, the statement of significance for 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, links to this theme of interwar commercial development, identifying the place as 'a representative example of an interwar shop' (Criterion D).

- [28] As noted in the study methodology report, while shops from the Victoria, Federation and Edwardian periods are well represented on the HO in the City of Moreland, there are fewer examples representing commercial activity of the interwar period in the municipality. It states:

Of those that are included in the HO, most have been altered with typical changes including replacement of the shopfront and/or awning, whilst others have had visible additions at the rear.

- [29] The relative lack of intact examples of shops from the interwar period represented on the HO make the shop at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, a sound representative example of this type.

- [30] At this point the 'intactness' or 'integrity' of the place becomes an important consideration. The Moreland Heritage Gap Study adopted definitions of these terms that were established in the Panel Report for Latrobe Planning Scheme Amendment C14 (pp.16–17). These definitions are as follows:

Intactness relates to the wholeness of (or lack of alteration to) the place. Depending on the grounds for significance, this can relate to a reference point of original construction or may include original construction with progressive accretions or alterations.

Integrity in respect to a heritage place is a descriptor of the veracity of the place as a meaningful document of the heritage from which it purports to draw its significance. For example, a place proposed as important on account of its special architectural details may be said to lack integrity if those features are destroyed or obliterated. It may be said to have low integrity if some of those features are altered. In the same case but where significance related to, say, an historical association, the place may retain its integrity despite the changes to the fabric (Structural integrity is a slightly different matter. It usually describes the basic structural sufficiency of a building).

Based on this approach it is clear that whilst some heritage places may have low intactness they may still have high integrity – the Parthenon ruins may be a good

example. On the other hand, a reduction in intactness may threaten a place's integrity to such a degree that it loses its significance.

- [31] The Moreland Heritage Gap Study highlights 'intactness' as a primary consideration in assessing places of potential individual significance. It is noted however that, 'comparative analysis would determine whether a building with lower 'intactness', but good 'integrity' could also be of local significance if, for example, it is rare'. (p.83)
- [32] 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, retains intact physical elements associated with the building typology and its original design. This includes its original shop front configuration, copper-framed display windows, glazed blue bricks to the lower façade, recessed entry door and timber framed and glazed entry door. The retention of these original elements within the façade, including its parapet and other key component parts, represents the typology of the interwar shop with authenticity and veracity.
- [33] The cantilevered verandah may retain original fabric, however, as acknowledged in the place citation, it has been subject to alterations. With its deep canopy sheltering the footpath below, the verandah is typical of the building type and so aids an historical understanding of the place even in its altered state. The changes are potentially reversible, and it is not considered that they unduly distract from an appreciation of the largely intact street presentation of the shop. Likewise, the air-conditioning unit situated above the verandah, which is an addition that has been made since the time of the place citation photographs taken in 2017, is also readily removeable and does not unduly detract from an understanding of place.
- [34] As such, I concur with the study methodology report which describes 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East as 'notable for [its] high-quality design, and high degree of intactness and integrity' (p.28).
- [35] Along with this architectural representativeness, the Statement of Significance also grounds the significance of the place in relation to the distinctive aesthetic articulation of its parapet. This is a visually striking element of the building and makes a vibrant contribution to the streetscape.
- [36] As stated in the place citation, the 'stepped profile and geometric patterning' of the parapet 'demonstrates the influence of the Jazz Moderne or Art Deco Style' (Criterion E). The Art Deco style is associated with a strong interplay between vertical elements and horizontal form and with the application of low relief geometric decoration. Geometric shapes, including stepped patterns, zigzags, chevrons and stylised sun rays and flora, were common motifs.

- [37] The parapet of 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, with its stepped outline, geometric detailing and contrasting materiality, displays many of the stylistic indicators of the Jazz Moderne or Art Deco Style. I agree with the application of Criterion E in relation to the bold detailing and contrasting materials of the parapet above verandah level. I note that the overall aesthetic continuity and impact of the place is enhanced by the retention of the intact shopfront with its glazed blue bricks to the lower façade and copper framed display windows. The blue glazed brick work is referred to as a blue tiled stallboard in the place citation. It is recommended that this reference is altered as part of minor editorial changes to the place citation.
- [38] On closer inspection, the façade incorporates two types of bricks in a sophisticated way not fully acknowledged by the place citation. Textured tapestry bricks are used in the lower part of the parapet, below verandah level and as a highlight in one row of the stepped upper part of the parapet. Smooth-faced clinker bricks are used in the stepped upper part of the parapet where they are contrasted stepped render bands. It is recommended that a reference to the textured tapestry bricks is added as part of minor editorial changes to the place citation.
- [39] As noted in the 'Review of Heritage Provisions in Planning Schemes. Advisory Committee Report' (2007), the process for establishing a threshold for significance 'is essentially a comparative one within the local area' (p2-45). It involves careful consideration of the significant aspects of the place with reference to the heritage criteria followed by a comparison with similar places within the local area, particularly those already included on the Heritage Overlay. This comparison is used to determine whether a place meets the threshold for significance demonstrated by other recognised examples, or where such examples are scant or non-existent, to establish a critical context for assessment.
- [40] In the case of 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, as noted above, the shop retains the original physical components that readily identify it as an example of an interwar shopfront. With its bold composition, distinctive stylistic features and intact materiality it is a clear exemplar of the Jazz Moderne or Art Deco Style. While this blend of period and style is underrepresented on the HO, it compares favourably with those interwar shops which incorporate Art Deco influences, as noted in the place citation and with interwar shops on the HO more broadly.
- [41] Two examples of shops in this style are a former corner shop at 25 Daley Street, Brunswick West, and the former Dairy & Milk Bar at 136A Nicholson Street, Brunswick East.

[42] The former shop at 25 Daley Street, Brunswick West, is contributory within heritage precinct HO56. This shop features contrasting clinker brickwork and a stepped vertical motif on the centre of its Daley Street parapet. However, it is less aesthetically coherent and visually striking than the subject site. In line with its contributory status, 25 Daley Street, Brunswick West, is also less intact. The main shop front has been replaced, but a smaller original shopfront is retained in the side façade.

[43] The former Dairy & Milk Bar at 136A Nicholson Street, Brunswick East, is included on the HO as an individual place: HO515. As such it is more directly comparable with 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East. The former milk bar illustrates the influence of the Art Deco style in its original signage but otherwise is better associated with the Streamlined Moderne style. That is, it is a less resolute example of the Art Deco style and, with its overpainted brick work (reversible but visually obtrusive), it is in a less original state than the subject shop at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East.

[44] Some other examples of interwar shops in Moreland are:

- Shop, 129 Lygon Street, Brunswick East (Contributory within precinct HO438). It has an original shop front, but the cantilevered verandah has been removed. The design of the parapet, and the façade more broadly, is more conventional and has been overpainted. The subject site at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, is superior in terms of its design execution and intactness.
- Former HPL Morris Chemist, 153 Reynard Street Coburg (Individual HO532). Designed in 1936 by architects Carleton & Carleton, the shop is notable for its high design quality and its intactness. The subject site at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, compares well with this place as an intact exemplar of an interwar shop which displays alternative and less conventional stylistic influences.
- Former Brunswick and Coburg UFS Dispensary, 228 Melville Road, Brunswick (Individual HO524). Opened in 1930, this single-storey interwar commercial building is highly intact and retains original signage. The subject site at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, compares well with this place as an intact exemplar of an interwar shop which displays alternative and less conventional stylistic influences.

[45] Comparison with the above interwar shops already on the HO confirms that 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, meets the threshold of an individually significant

place. It does so in terms of its capacity to represent the interwar shop typology, its aesthetic distinctiveness and merit, and its degree of intactness.

Isolation from heritage context

[46] *The submitter argues that the isolation of the place from any heritage context makes it a poor candidate for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay.*

[47] 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, has been assessed as an individually significant place rather than as part of a heritage precinct.

[48] As noted above, it is considered that the place meets the threshold of individual significance and compares favourably with relevant individual examples already on or recommended for the HO. The place embodies its own heritage significance and is not reliant on a supporting heritage context to adequately demonstrate its local architectural and aesthetic values.

Retention of facade

[49] *The submitter proposes retention of the façade of the building as part of a wider property redevelopment and feels this 'addresses whatever cultural heritage significance the building enjoys'.*

[50] While it has been determined to retain the façade of the building in the context of a wider property development, this does not negate the role of a Heritage Overlay to protect the assessed heritage value of the place into the future.

[51] With proper conservation of the heritage values of the place, it is likely that they will endure beyond the time frame of any current redevelopment options for the place. Appropriate planning controls should be in place to ensure that the heritage significance of the place is retained in an ongoing sense and that any proposed changes are assessed in light of this significance.

2.2.4 Conclusion and recommendations

[52] It is my opinion that 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East, meets the threshold as an individually significant place. I reiterate the findings of the Moreland Heritage Gap Study (2019) and recommended the inclusion of the subject site in the Moreland Heritage Overlay as an individual place.

[53] I recommend that minor editorial revisions are made to the place citation, including the addition of a reference to textured tapestry brick, clinker bricks and glazed blue bricks in the place description and Statement of Significance.

3 References

Historica 2010, *City of Moreland Thematic History*, prepared for City of Moreland.

Context 2019, *Moreland Heritage Gap Study*, prepared for City of Moreland.

Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning (DELWP) 2018, *Planning Practice Note 1 'Applying Heritage Overlay'*.



For me, heritage is as much about the future as the past. The way in which the continuities and changes of living culture are expressed in built fabric and cultural landscapes never cease to fascinate me.

Dr Kim Roberts

Associate

Kim is a registered architect with a background in contemporary architectural design; she has specialised in heritage architecture, heritage planning and heritage asset management for over 16 years. Kim is a passionate advocate of cultural heritage and delights in developing innovative responses to heritage contexts.

Working in a range of private and public sector roles, Kim has taken on the roles of project and design architect, heritage planner and heritage consultant on a variety of heritage project types and scales. Kim has experience in the areas of architectural conservation, adaptive re-use, heritage planning and management, peer design review (with focus on heritage), academic research and architectural education. She has been extensively engaged in the provision of strategic and statutory heritage advice, including heritage asset management strategies, conservation management plans and heritage impact statements.

Prior to joining GML, Kim developed a Heritage Asset Management Strategy for the state-wide asset portfolios of the Director of Housing and Secretary of Human Services and managed the long-term implementation of this Strategy.

Kim completed a PhD on the Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park designed by Kenzo Tange and visitor responses to and interpretation of this memorial landscape at Deakin University. Throughout her career, Kim has taught in the areas of history, theory and design, frequently participating as a guest critic within architectural design studios.

Qualifications

Registered Architect, ARBV No. 16148
 Doctor of Philosophy, Deakin University
 Bachelor of Architecture (Honours), Deakin University
 Bachelor of Arts – Literature (Honours), Deakin University

Professional affiliations

Member, Victorian Design Review Panel
 Member, Australian Institute of Architects
 Affiliate Member, Planning Institute of Australia

Key experience

Conservation management plans

- South African War Memorial, St Kilda—Client: City of Port Phillip, current
- Ballarat East Town Hall Gardens Conservation Management Plan—Client: City of Ballarat, 2020
- St Kilda Cemetery Conservation Management Plan—Client: Southern Metropolitan Cemeteries Trust, 2020
- Brighton General Cemetery Conservation Management Plan—Client: Southern Metropolitan Cemeteries Trust, 2020
- Abbotsford Convent Conservation Management Plan Project—Client: Abbotsford Convent Foundation, 2019
- 295 Whitehall Street, Yarraville Conservation Management Plan—Client: Independent Cement and Lime, 2019
- Emerald Hill Estate Conservation Management Plans 1–4 (for Department of Health and Human Services), 2012–2018

Built heritage assessments

- South Yarra Heritage Review—Client: City of Melbourne, current
- Nillumbik Heritage Study—Client: Shire of Nillumbik, current
- Maldon Central Historic Area Review: Significance and Heritage Impact Assessment—Client: Mount Alexander Shire Council, current
- Doveton Pool in the Park—Client: City of Casey, 2021
- Baimbridge College, Hamilton—Client: Victorian School Building Authority, 2020
- Elwood Foreshore Facilities Strategy Heritage Study—Client: City of Port Phillip, 2020
- Bayside Mid-Century Modern Heritage Study (Council and residential self-nominated places)—Client: Bayside City Council, 2020
- Moreland Stage 1 Built Heritage Assessment—Client: Moreland City Council, 2018

Heritage consulting

- Kelly House Heritage Conservation Works—Client: DELWP, current
- Palais Theatre and Luna Park Precinct Revitalisation—Client: City of Port Phillip, 2020
- St Vincent Gardens Playground—Client: City of Port Phillip, 2020
- Supreme Court Redevelopment—Heritage Architect/Heritage Consultant (for Lovell Chen/Billard Leece Partnership), 2007
- Shepparton Showgrounds Redevelopment—Architect/Heritage Consultant (for RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants), 2006
- Parliament House of Victoria, various projects—Architect/Heritage Consultant (for RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants), 2006
- Carlton Housing Redevelopment, Former Queen Elizabeth Centre—Heritage Consultant (for RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants), 2005

Heritage asset management

- Heritage Asset Management Plan (for Department of Health and Human Services), 2008–2018
- Heritage Asset Inventory (for Department of Health and Human Services), 2010–2016
- Heritage Asset Procedures and Guidelines (for Department of Health and Human Services), 2012–2018

Design

- Preston Tramways Workshops Master Plan—Design Architect/Heritage Consultant (for Lovell Chen), 2007
- Supreme Court Redevelopment—Heritage Architect/Heritage Consultant (for Lovell Chen/Billard Leece Partnership), 2007
- Shepparton Showgrounds Redevelopment—Architect/Heritage Consultant (for RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants), 2006
- Parliament House of Victoria, various projects—Architect/Heritage Consultant (for RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants), 2006
- Glenlyon Church Residential Conversion (for Multiplicity), 2003

Professional background

Associate, GML Heritage (formerly Context), 2019–present

Member, Victorian Design Review Panel, 2016–present

Heritage Planner, Department of Health and Human Services, 2008–2018

Architect and Heritage Consultant, Neil Architecture, 2007–2008

Architect and Heritage Consultant, Lovell Chen, 2005–2007

Architect and Heritage Consultant, RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants), 2003–2005

Architectural graduate, Multiplicity, 2001–2003

Architectural graduate, Greg Jones and Associates, 1999–2001

Publications

Roberts, K, 'Hiroshima: notes on the expanded field', in Frichot, H and Stead, N (eds), *Writing Architectures: Ficto-Critical Approaches*, Bloomsbury, 2020

Roberts, K, 'Hiroshima space: the pathways of post-memory', in Beljaars, D and Drozynski, C (eds), *Civic Spaces and Desire*, Routledge, 2019, pp 95–114

Roberts, K, 'The Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park and the shadow side of spatial research', *Haunting, Fabrications: Journal of the*

Society of Architectural Historians, Australia and New Zealand 29:1, 2019, pp 86–108

Roberts, K, 'Design as precursor: Michel de Certeau's "practice" and the Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park', *The Marvellous Real: Past Gazing, Future Glimpses, Double Dialogues*, Issue 17, Winter 2015

Roberts, K, 'Chapter 1: Reconstruction and Verisimilitude after the event: A poet and a city', in McCulloch, A and Goodrich, RA (eds), *The Event, the Subject and the Artwork: Into the Twenty-First Century*, Cambridge Scholars Publishing, Newcastle on Tyne, 2015, pp 12–30

Roberts, K, 'Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park: an architectural consignment', in Lozanovska, M (ed), *Cultural Ecology: New Approaches to Culture, Architecture and Ecology*, School of Architecture + Built Environment, Deakin University, Geelong, 2013, pp 66–73

Roberts, K, 'Bridge, Mirror, Labyrinth: Shaping the Intervals of Calvino's Invisible Cities', in Mehigan, T (ed), *Frameworks, Artworks, Place: The Space of Perception in the Modern World*, Rodopi, Amsterdam, 2008, pp 137–158

Datta, S, Morison, D and Roberts, K, 'Pedagogical templates: a comparative study of higher order reflective making', in *Proceedings of the 1st Playful Design Learning Forum*, School of Architecture, Landscape Architecture and Urban Design, Adelaide University, Adelaide, 2001, pp 1–9

Presentations

Roberts, K, 'The Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park and the shadow side of spatial research', conference paper, Haunting, Memory, Place, Australian Centre for Architecture History, Urban and Cultural Heritage (ACAUCH) Annual Symposium, Melbourne School of Design, University of Melbourne, 2017

Roberts, K, 'Hiroshima: notes of the expanded-field', conference paper, Colloquium on Ficto-Critical Approaches to a Writing Architecture, University of Queensland, 2016

Roberts, K, 'Hi-ro-shi-ma space: post-memorial navigations of the Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park', conference paper, Rethinking Modern Asia-Pacific Architectures: Postgraduate Student Plenary, Melbourne University, 2016

Roberts, K, 'Hi-ro-shi-ma space: the pathways of post-memory', conference paper, Spaces of Desire: Remembrance and Civic Power, Cardiff University, 2016

Roberts, K, 'Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park: a navigational meditation from the outside', conference paper, Exploring Japan through New Lenses: Emerging Themes in Japanese Studies Postgraduate Symposium hosted by The Japanese Studies Centre, Monash University, 2015

Roberts, K, 'Past Lineage and Future Vector: Kenzo Tange and the Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park', conference paper, Precursors into the Future International Symposium, Cardiff University, Cardiff Metropolitan & University of South Wales, 2014

Roberts, K, 'Forgetting, Space and Survival: Ethico-Aesthetics and the Hiroshima Peace Memorial Park', conference paper, 9th International Conference on Environmental, Cultural, Economic and Social Sustainability Hiroshima, Japan, 2013

Roberts, K, 'Reconstruction and verisimilitude after the event: the curious space of Araki Yasusada', conference paper, Double Dialogues conference: The Twenty-First Century: The Event, the Subject and the Artwork, University of the South Pacific, Suva, Fiji, 2012

Roberts, K, 'Celebrity: image space, ground zero', conference paper, Inaugural Celebrity Studies Journal Conference, Burwood, Australia, 2012

Roberts, K, 'Bridge, Mirror, Labyrinth: Shaping the Intervals of Calvino's Invisible Cities', conference paper, Double Dialogues

conference, On Space, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand,
2006

Datta, S, Morison, D and Roberts, K, 'Pedagogical templates: a
comparative study of higher order reflective making', paper presented
at 1st Playful Design Learning Forum, School of Architecture,
Landscape Architecture and Urban Design, Adelaide University,
Adelaide, Australia, 2001

Memberships

Australian Institute of Architects

Planning Institute of Australia

Society of Architectural Historians, Australia and New Zealand

Appendix B

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Name SHOP

Address 151A LYGON STREET, BRUNSWICK EAST

Significance Level Local

Place Type Shop

Citation Date 2017



151A Lygon Street Brunswick East

**Recommended
Heritage
Protection**

VHR – HI – PS Yes

Architectural Style Interwar Period (c.1919-c.1940)

History

Thematic context

This place is associated with the following theme/s identified by the City of Moreland Thematic History (2010):

Theme Nine: Shopping and retailing in Moreland

Shopping is a necessary part of the daily life of a community and shops give their customers a sense of continuity and tradition. They are a very visible attribute of Moreland's streetscapes, particularly the major thoroughfares of Sydney Road and Lygon Street. The municipality has a proud and colourful retail heritage that spans from the earliest days of settlement - from small stores to specialist shops, banks, markets, emporiums, and shopping malls and plazas. All of these retail outlets have grown to meet and create shoppers' needs and are a significant part of Moreland's history and heritage, lending character and distinctiveness to its streets (Historica 2010:97).

The historic shops built during Moreland's periods of economic prosperity in the late nineteenth century and 1920s and 1930s continue to line the Sydney Road corridor, many with facades still intact. More intact shops stand on street corners tucked away from main thoroughfares, providing clues to former centres of high activity, such as brickyards and other industries that once sustained them. There is also the occasional corner milk bar, a fading phenomenon of the 1950s and earlier, some still with original shop windows, doors and vestiges of original signage (Historica 2010:103).

Suburban development of Brunswick

Brunswick was surveyed in 1839 to provide 16 farming allotments ranging in size from 100 to 300 acres. The allotments each had a frontage to either the Moonee Ponds or Merri Creeks and to a north-south track (now Sydney Road). They were quickly sold in three auctions, mostly to speculators, and re-subdivision began almost immediately. On the west side of Sydney Road James Simpson subdivided his allotment creating Albert (then Carmarthen) and Victoria (then Llandillo) streets. When Thomas Wilkinson purchased the allotment on the opposite side of Sydney Road he extended Albert and Victoria streets. This pattern was repeated many times, and each time the land was divided into smaller and smaller allotments (Context v.1, 1990:10).

The colony of Victoria was expanding rapidly during the 1850s in the wake of the gold rushes and in the twenty years between 1846 and 1865 Brunswick's population grew from 146 to 3000 creating a demand for housing. The sequence of subdivision generally followed transport and access routes. The opening of the railway to Coburg in 1884 and the cable tram along Sydney Road in 1887 providing direct access to the centre of city encouraged the subdivision and development of land along these routes. This process accelerated during the 1880s a time of economic prosperity accompanied by a boom in land prices and in the twenty years from 1865 to the 1880s the population of Brunswick more than tripled to 14,000. Many of the houses built during the boom were cottages and small villas to accommodate the growing number of workers employed in the expanding industries. However, all development was brought to a halt by the economic depression of the 1890s and many of the new estates offered for sale toward the end of the boom remained undeveloped until the early twentieth century (Historica 2010:59-62).

Development recommenced during the early twentieth when houses began to be built on the vacant nineteenth century subdivisions. The development was slow at first, but another boom followed World War I. In 1905 the population had reached 24,000 and by 1928 it had more than doubled to 55,799 (Barnes 1987:64). The rapid growth of Brunswick during the early twentieth century was once again driven by expansion of employment opportunities and improvements to public transport. In the early twentieth century the introduction of duties on imported goods led to a boom in local manufacturing and by 1930 there were 300 factories in Brunswick employing over 6,000 workers (Historica 2010:32). During this time the nineteenth century subdivisions were re-offered for sale whilst the remaining areas of farming land and large estates in the east and west of Brunswick were carved up to meet the unprecedented demand for housing. By the end of the 1930s the suburban development of Brunswick was almost complete (Context v.1, 1990:12).

Lygon Street

Lygon Street, originally known as Cameron Street, began as an extension of Weston Street up to Brunswick Road prior to the 1850s. The construction of the street between Brunswick Road and Glenlyon Street paved the way for the emergence of an independent village of East Brunswick. By 1870 Cameron Street had been renamed Lygon Street by the Melbourne City Council, after Lord Lygon, a renowned British statesman of the nineteenth century (Barnes 1987:74).

Lygon Street had been extended from its modest beginnings in the 1850s to reach all the way to Moreland Road by 1900. Extension of the street, as well as its development in general, occurred incrementally, progressing northwards from Brunswick Road, with most early development concentrated at its southern end. The Quarry Hotel was established prior to 1857 and named presumably for the numerous quarries in the vicinity that provided much of its clientele. By the 1880s, the southern end of Lygon Street between Brunswick Road and Edward Street, was increasingly consolidated by the turn of the century. Alongside small residences were a diverse array of small shops that serviced the needs of local residents, including greengrocers, dressmakers, bootmakers, pastrycooks and manufacturers. A bank, a post office and a register of births and deaths were also there by the early 1900s.

In the meantime, development of the remainder of Lygon Street was localised and sporadic and in 1900 large tracts of land remained vacant north of Edward Streets. Pockets of development, however, echoed the neighbourhood that had emerged at the Brunswick Road end, most notably on the east side, between Edward and Victoria streets. The west side, however, remained largely undeveloped, apart from the shop at

the northwest corner of Edward Street (no.119) and an isolated terrace row at the north corner of Ann Street (nos. 313-321).

Further expansion occurred in the early years of the twentieth century prior to the First World War, and saw the establishment of numerous small shopping precincts at various points along the street to serve the growing resident population in the side streets. Small factories began to appear on Lygon Street by the early twentieth century, though much construction remained focussed on the provision of local shops for local needs. Retail and shopping premises were marked by the frequent turnover of occupants, though there tended to be substantial continuity of use.

Electric tram lines, replacing horse-drawn buses, were installed on Lygon Street in 1916, and this encouraged further consolidation of the street. By the 1920s, the vacant blocks of land that remained on Lygon Street began to be taken over by small and large factories, shops and semi-industrial enterprises. Textile and manufacturing factories dominated the previously undeveloped northern end of the street, taking advantage of the large blocks of land that had remained vacant until that time. By the 1930s, Lygon Street was a hive of manufacturing activity, boasting amongst others the Perfection Knitting Mills, J. S. Grey paper bag manufacturing and the Austral Wire Fence and Gate Co., and this led to a demand for housing, which in turn created a need for further retail premises to serve the rapidly growing population. Interestingly, apart from the early residences established at the Brunswick Road end of Lygon Street, it was not until the 1930s that further residential accommodation was built. Several blocks of flats, notably at 299 and 434 Lygon Street were constructed. The continued lack of residential accommodation on the street emphasised its function in the local community as a shopping and manufacturing precinct, where residents of the back and side streets were able to service their needs and socialise with their neighbours. The Lygon Picture Theatre was established in 1922, which, along with the three hotels, numerous coffee palaces and the established local-shopping precincts, consolidated the social role of Lygon Street.

Place history

The block on the west side of Lygon Street between Edward Street and Glenlyon Road was mostly undeveloped in 1900. The exception was the bluestone shop at the northwest corner of Edward Street, which had been constructed in 1887. This remained the only shop in 1910, however, by 1920 there were about five new premises including a butcher, estate agent and furniture emporium. This block filled out considerably during the boom of the early 1920s and by 1925 there were only two or three vacant lots remaining, including this property. The new shops included a lady's draper, greengrocer, baker, fishmonger, confectioner, and tailor (SM).

Construction of the shop at 151A Lygon Street commenced in 1934 and it was completed by early 1935 (PSP). In the 1935 Directory, it was described as a 'being built' and in the following year it was occupied by one U. Bogdanoff, a fruiterer.

Sources

Barnes, Les (1987) 'Street Names of Brunswick'
 Brunswick Rate Books (RB), 1887 (South Ward, No. in rate, 1212), 1888 (1367), 1888-89 (1467), 1889-90 (1742)
 Context Pty Ltd, *Keeping Brunswick's Heritage. A report on the review of the Brunswick Conservation Study*, Volume 1, 1990
 Context Pty Ltd, *Lygon Street Heritage Study Stage One*, City of Moreland, 2008
 Historica, *City of Moreland Thematic History*, 2010
 Melbourne & Metropolitan Board of Works (MMBW) Detail Plan No.1869, dated 1904
 Penrose, Helen (ed.), *Brunswick: one history, many voices*, Victoria Press, South Melbourne, 1994
 Property Service Plan (PSP) No. 194246
 Sands & McDougall Directories (SM)

Description

Physical Description

This is a single-storey shop with finely detailed stepped parapet with geometric patterning in clinker brick and render. It retains an original shopfront with metal-framed windows, ~~blue tiled stallboard~~, ~~glazed blue bricks to the lower façade~~ and a recessed entry with tiled floor and a glazed timber door. The cantilevered verandah may be original but has been boxed in. The building is highly intact with no significant visible alterations.

Comparative Analysis

Whilst there are many shops represented in the Heritage Overlay in Moreland, the majority is from the Victorian, Federation and Edwardian periods, and there are fewer examples from the interwar period. Of those that are included in the HO, most have been altered with typical changes including replacement of the shopfront and/or awning, whilst others have had visible additions at the rear. Consequently, there are fewer interwar shops or commercial buildings of individual significance in the HO in Moreland.

This shop is notable for the distinctive stepped profile and geometric patterning of the parapet and pediment, which demonstrate the influence of the Jazz Moderne or Art Deco style. The Art Deco style, which took its name from the Exposition Internationale des Arts Decoratifs held in Paris in 1925, was essentially one of applied decoration. Buildings were richly embellished with hard-edged low-relief designs: geometric or 'zigzag' shapes, including chevrons and ziggurats; and stylized floral and sunrise patterns. Designs which drew on ancient cultures including the Egyptians, Mayans and Aztecs are also hallmarks of the style.

Few examples of this style exist in Moreland. One example is the former corner shop at 25 Daly Street, Brunswick West (Contributory within HO56 precinct). This also has an intact Jazz Moderne style brick parapet, but is not as boldly executed as here. It is also less intact: the main shopfront has been replaced, but there is a smaller original shopfront in the side elevation. The influence of the Art Deco style can also be seen in the original signage at the former Dairy & Milk Bar at 136A Nicholson Street, Brunswick East (Recommended for inclusion in the HO by this Study), although that building is otherwise more typical of the Streamlined Moderne style.

Other examples of interwar shops in Moreland include:

- Former Chemist Shop, 153 Reynard Street, Coburg (Recommended for inclusion in the HO). Designed by architects, Carleton & Carleton, and constructed in 1936, this is perhaps the finest interwar shop in Moreland and is notable for the high quality design, materials and overall intactness. Not directly comparable in terms of its style (which draws on Old English influences).
- Shop, 129 Lygon Street (Contributory with HO438 precinct). This has an original shop front, but the awning has been removed. The parapet is of a more conventional type and has been overpainted.
- Moreland Market, 68 Sydney Road, Coburg (Recommended for future assessment). Constructed in 1931 this is a large interwar commercial building with multiple shops with an intact facade including original shopfronts and parapet with original signage.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

The shop, constructed by 1935, at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East is significant. This is a single-storey shop with a finely detailed stepped parapet featuring geometric patterning in ~~clinker brick~~ textured tapestry bricks and render. It retains an original shopfront with metal-framed windows, ~~blue tiled stallboard~~, glazed blue bricks to the lower façade and a recessed entry with tiled floor and a glazed timber door. The cantilevered verandah may be original but has been boxed in.

Non original alterations and additions are not significant.

How is it significant?

The shop at 151A Lygon Street, Brunswick East is of local architectural and aesthetic significance to the City of Moreland.

Why is it significant?

It is significant as a representative example of an interwar shop that is notable for its high degree of intactness. The parapet, **with the distinctive** stepped profile and geometric patterning, which demonstrates the influence of the Jazz Moderne or Art Deco style, and retains the **original finishes** is a notable feature, and is complemented by the original shopfront. (Criteria D & E)

Assessment against criteria

This has been assessed in accordance with the Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance (the Burra Charter) and the guidelines in the VPP Practice Note Applying the Heritage Overlay using the Hercon criteria.

Recommendations 2017

External Paint Controls
Internal Alteration Controls
Tree Controls
Fences & Outbuildings
Prohibited Uses May Be Permitted
Incorporated Plan
Aboriginal Heritage Place

-
-
-
-
-
-
-

Other recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay as an individual place. No specific HO controls are required.